© 2024 The Authors Published by the European Association of Geochemistry

**Geochemical<sup>®)EAG</sup>** 

Perspect

# **E** Basalts record a limited extent of mantle depletion: cause and chemical geodynamic implications

A. Stracke<sup>1\*</sup>, P. Béquelin<sup>1,#</sup>

OPEN C **ACCESS** Abstract <https://doi.org/10.7185/geochemlet.2437>



Radiogenic isotope ratios in basalts from mid-ocean ridges are commonly thought to represent the time-integrated extent of incompatible element depletion of the subridge, peridotitic mantle. Earth's peridotitic mantle, however, is variably incompatible element depleted, and inherently heterogeneous as a consequence of prior melting. After aging for several  $10^{7}$ – $10^{9}$  years in the mantle before remelting today, the heterogeneous peridotites are characterised by a much larger range of radiogenic isotope ratios than ridge basalts. The simple reason why ridge, but also ocean island basalts, reflect only a limited range of this enormous isotopic spectrum of peridotites is that mixing of melts from Earth's heterogeneous mantle moderates peridotite heterogeneity. Variable peridotite compositions may nevertheless be responsible for iso-

topic differences between ridge and ocean island basalts, and contribute significantly to the thermochemical buoyancy of mantle plumes, and density-driven mantle flow in general. Variable peridotite depletion therefore connects geochemical and geophysical observables, and is a critical parameter for advancing our understanding of basalt generation, plume formation, and chemical geodynamic models of mantle convection.

Received 1 May 2024 | Accepted 9 September 2024 | Published 1 October 2024

# Mantle Compositional Evolution

Earth's mantle evolves continuously by returning peridotite melted under mid-ocean ridges into the deeper mantle via subduction, and remelting these residual, variably incompatible element (ICE) depleted peridotites once they are transported back into the shallow mantle. This basic concept (e.g., [Langmuir](#page-4-0) et al., [1992](#page-4-0); Willig et al.[, 2020](#page-5-0); [Stracke, 2021](#page-5-0); [Fig. 1](#page-1-0)) explains why ICE depleted basalts erupt at mid-ocean ridges. The Nd-Hf isotope ratios of mid-ocean ridge basalts (MORB) further show that these peridotites have resided in the mantle for some  $10^7\text{--}10^9$  years before being remelted, because the Nd-Hf isotope ratios are higher, on average, than those of the Bulk Silicate Earth (BSE; White et al.[, 2015;](#page-5-0) [Stracke](#page-5-0) et al., 2022). This cycle of melting and remelting of Earth's peridotitic mantle generates oceanic crust, and is the surface expression of the internal engine that drives plate tectonics. The number of melting cycles the peridotites may have undergone, their corresponding extent of ICE depletion, and their residence time in the mantle, however, remain major unknowns in our understanding of mantle compositional evolution, and mantle-crust mass fluxes in general.

An integral aspect of partial mantle melting, under midocean ridges or the shallow mantle of actively upwelling mantle ("plumes"), is that peridotites that move on different paths through the melting region melt to different extents ([Fig. 1\)](#page-1-0). The peridotites that return and become recirculated within the mantle after partial melting are highly heterogeneous, and range from compositions similar to average "depleted mantle" [\(Salters](#page-4-0)

[and Stracke, 2004](#page-4-0)) to peridotites, which are almost devoid of ICEs ([Fig. 1](#page-1-0)). In other words, any ICE depleted mantle sampled today is, by origin, a highly heterogeneous assemblage of compositionally, and isotopically, variable peridotites.

During residence in the mantle, these heterogeneous peridotites are stretched, disintegrated, redistributed, stirred and become dispersed by the convective flow ([Fig. 1\)](#page-1-0), but they do not homogenise diffusively ([Hofmann and Hart, 1978;](#page-4-0) [Hart,](#page-4-0) [1993](#page-4-0)). An inevitable, but mostly neglected, consequence is that the radiogenic isotope ratios of variably ICE depleted and aged peridotites develop extreme values during several  $10^{7}-10^{9}$  years of residence in the mantle. These values reach far beyond the isotopic spectrum of MORB ([Fig. 1](#page-1-0)), as observed in abyssal peridotites (e.g., [Stracke](#page-5-0) et al., 2011; Sani et al.[, 2023\)](#page-5-0). A fundamental question, therefore, is: why do oceanic basalts, i.e. MORB and basalts from oceanic islands (OIB), not mirror this enormous range of radiogenic isotope ratios of the peridotitic mantle?

# Melting Earth's Heterogeneous Mantle

The answer to the question above is simple: partial melting of peridotite produces basaltic oceanic crust, which is returned into the deeper mantle together with the residual, melt-depleted peridotites. The recycled crust and peridotites become stirred and dispersed within the mantle by convection. As a result, Earth's present mantle is chemically and lithologically heterogeneous, and consists of variably ICE depleted peridotite plus

Corresponding author (e-mail: [astra\\_01@uni-muenster.de](mailto:astra_01@uni-muenster.de))



<sup>1.</sup> Institut für Mineralogie, Universität Münster, Corrensstrasse 24, 48149 Münster, Germany

current address: School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Cardiff University, Park Place, Cardiff, CF10 3AT, Cardiff, United Kingdom

<span id="page-1-0"></span>

Figure 1 Generation of variably ICE depleted peridotite by partial melting average peridotitic mantle to a maximum extent of melting of 16 %. Lower right panel shows calculated isotopic evolution within 1.5 Myr. Elemental concentrations before depletion: C<sup>Nd</sup> = 0.713 μg/g,  $\mathsf{C}^\mathsf{sm}$  = 0.270 μg/g ([Salters and Stracke, 2004](#page-4-0)). Bulk partition coefficients: D<sup>Nd</sup> = 0.024, D<sup>sm</sup> = 0.037 ([Stracke and Bourdon, 2009](#page-5-0)). Depletion age: 1.5 Ga. Initial <sup>143</sup>Nd/<sup>144</sup>Nd (at 1.5 Ga) = 0.510877. Decay constant:  $\lambda^{147}$ Sm = 6.54 × 10<sup>-12</sup>.

ICE enriched recycled oceanic (± continental) crust (Fig. 1; e.g., [Stracke 2012](#page-5-0), [2021](#page-5-0) and references therein). Hence, oceanic basalts are mixtures of melts from chemically and lithologically heterogeneous mantle. As such, oceanic basalts represent a weighted average of melts from the different mantle components, but their isotope ratios are rarely, if ever, identical to those of a single mantle component.

Specifically, isotope ratios in oceanic basalts are mixtures between melts from peridotites and recycled crust (± other components). Peridotites are the volumetrically dominant component (>85–90 %), but are also ICE depleted, whereas recycled crust is a minor (<10–15 %), but ICE enriched, component in Earth's mantle (e.g., [Stracke](#page-5-0) et al., 2022 and references therein). The isotopic range of the heterogeneous peridotites is, therefore, not conveyed unchanged to oceanic basalts, but rather significantly shifted toward the isotope ratio of melts from the ICE enriched mantle component(s). Because lithophile elements with geologically useful radiogenic isotope ratios (Sr, Ce, Nd, Hf, Pb) are all ICEs, their inventory in oceanic basalts derives mostly from melts of the ICE enriched mantle components (*i.e.* recycled oceanic  $\pm$  continental crust). The latter is demonstrated below with the example of melting of a two-component mantle that consists of ICE depleted peridotite ('per') and ICE enriched recycled crust ('rc', i.e. oceanic ± continental crust). The isotope ratio  $(IR)$  of element i in the derivative basalt is the weighted average of melts from the two mantle components:

$$
f_{\text{basalt}}C_{\text{basalt}}^iIR_{\text{basalt}}^i=f_{\text{per}}C_{\text{per}}^iIR_{\text{per}}^i+f_{\text{rc}}C_{\text{rc}}^iIR_{\text{rc}}^i
$$

$$
IR_{\text{basalt}}^i=(f_{\text{per}}C_{\text{per}}^iIR_{\text{per}}^i+f_{\text{rc}}C_{\text{rc}}^iIR_{\text{rc}}^i)/f_{\text{basalt}}C_{\text{basalt}}
$$

$$
Eq. 1
$$

with  $f$  = mass fraction of melt, which relates to the mass fraction, *m*, in the mantle by  $f = m \times F$ , F being the degree of melting in %, and  $C<sup>i</sup>$  being the concentrations of element i in melts from peridotite and recycled crust.

Equation 1 shows that the isotope ratios in basalts  $(IR<sup>i</sup><sub>basalt</sub>)$  are a trade-off between the abundance  $(m)$  of the two mantle components, the extent to which the peridotite and recycled crust melt  $(F)$ , the average composition of the melts from peridotite and recycled crust  $(C<sup>i</sup>)$ , and, of course, the corresponding isotope ratios in these melts (IR<sup>i</sup>). Isotope ratios in peridotites ( $IR<sup>i</sup><sub>per</sub>$ ) can be extreme, but are coupled to exceedingly low ICE concentrations (Fig. 1). Hence, although extreme  $IR_{\rm\,per}^{i}$  have a large leverage in Equation 1, these isotopic signatures are moderated by correspondingly low concentrations in the peridotites and their derivative melts ( $C^i_{\,\rm per}$ ). This is illustrated in [Figure 2](#page-2-0), which shows calculated  $IR^i_{\text{basalt}}$  that are a mix of a constant proportion of melts from recycled crust and peridotite from which variable amounts of melt have been extracted and aged for 1.5 Ga (Figs. 1, [2](#page-2-0), Eq. 1). Although  $IR_{\text{per}}^{i}$  becomes extremely high with an increasing degree of ancient melt extraction  $(F<sub>D</sub>)$ , subscript D for depletion) and, thus, an increasing extent of ICE depletion before renewed melting (Fig. 1),  $I\!R^i{}_{\rm basalt}$  peak at low to intermediate values of  $F_{\rm D}$  in [Figure 2,](#page-2-0) when  $C^{i}_{per}$  *PR*<sup>*i*</sup><sub>per</sub> reaches its maximum value (note that  $f_{per}$  and  $f_{rc}$  are constant in the calculation shown in [Fig. 2](#page-2-0)). With increasing extent of peridotite depletion  $(F_D)$ ,  $C_{\text{per}}^i \rightarrow 0$ , and thus the term  $f_{\rm per} C^{i}_{\rm per} I R^{i}$ also approaches 0. Effectively then,  $\hat{f}_{\text{basalt}}\tilde{C}_{\text{basalt}}^iR_{\text{basalt}}^i \to f_{\text{rc}}C_{\text{rc}}^iR_{\text{rc}}^i$  (Eq. 1), and  $IR_{\text{basalt}}^i \to IR_{\text{rc}}^i$ Hence, there is a natural limit to which the range of isotope ratios of the peridotitic mantle, and especially the  $IR_{\text{per}}^{i}$  of the most ICE depleted peridotites, are conveyed to the basalts.

Likewise, there is also a limit to which the isotope ratios of recycled components,  $IR_{\text{rc}}$  are reflected in basalts. For ICEs  $f_{\rm rc}C_{\rm rc}^i$  >  $f_{\rm per}C_{\rm per}^i$  and thus  $IR_{\rm basalt}^i$  also approaches  $IR_{\rm rc}^i$ especially if  $IR_{\text{rc}}^i > IR_{\text{per}}^i$  e.g., for Sr isotope ratios. For compatible elements, however,  $f_{\rm rc} C_{\rm rc}^i \ll f_{\rm per} C_{\rm per}^i$ , *i.e.* that  $IR_{\rm rc}^i$  only has a significant effect on  $IR<sup>i</sup>$ <sub>basalt</sub> if  $IR<sup>i</sup>$ <sub>rc</sub> >>  $IR<sup>i</sup>$ <sub>per</sub>. The latter is critical for evaluating whether recycled components can have significant imprint on the stable isotope ratios of compatible elements in



<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Figure 2 (a) Isotope ratio of aggregated melt (basalt) formed by mixing melts from variably ICE depleted peridotite and recycled crust as calculated with [Equation 1](#page-1-0), (b) Nd concentrations, and (c) Nd isotope ratios in variably ICE depleted peridotite aged for 1.5 Gyr before renewed melting. Recycled oceanic crust is a mixture of 96 % mafic crust (C<sup>Nd</sup> = 5.83 μg/g, C<sup>sm</sup> = 2.01 μg/g) and 4 % sediments (C<sup>Nd</sup> = 27.6 μg/g,  $C^{5m} = 6.0$  μg/g), also aged 1.5 Gyr with an initial <sup>143</sup>Nd/<sup>144</sup>Nd = 0.509667 for sediments and 0.510879 for mafic crust before melting at present. Present-day melting degrees are 8 % for peridotite and 64 % for recycled oceanic crust, and are constant for simplicity. Bulk partition coefficients used for calculating melt compositions, C<sub>per</sub><sup>Nd</sup> and C<sub>rc</sub><sup>Nd</sup>, are D<sub>rc</sub><sup>Nd</sup>= 0.024, D<sub>per</sub><sup>Nd</sup>= 0.148 [\(Stracke and Bourdon,](#page-5-0) [2009](#page-5-0)). Each curve in (a) corresponds to a distinct amount of recycled oceanic crust,  $m_{rc}$  in the mantle source (4-12 %), and each point of a curve corresponds to a distinct degree of peridotite depletion  $F_D$  (0–16 %).

oceanic basalts, e.g., for Cr, Ni, Mg, but also Zn, Fe and other transition elements. [Equation 1](#page-1-0) allows evaluating if natural and/or partial melting induced stable isotope variation in recycled components suffice to affect  $IR^i_{\text{basalt}}$ , but this is rarely considered (cf., Sodermann et al., 2022).

Hence, the value of  $IR_{\rm{basalt}}^{i}$  is determined by the param-eters in [Equation 1,](#page-1-0) i.e. the relative abundance, composition and intrinsic isotopic range of individual mantle components, which are, of course, inherently heterogeneous and not limited to only two components. The style and efficiency of mixing melts from individual components during extraction from the mantle and melt evolution in the crust also plays a crucial role for how the isotopic range of heterogeneous mantle components are reflected in the generated melts (e.g., [Stracke and Bourdon,](#page-5-0) [2009](#page-5-0); [Koornneef](#page-4-0) et al., 2012; [Rudge](#page-4-0) et al., 2013; [Shorttle](#page-5-0) et al., [2014](#page-5-0), [2016;](#page-5-0) [Neave](#page-4-0) et al., 2019; [Genske](#page-4-0) et al., 2019; [Stracke,](#page-5-0) [2021](#page-5-0)). Although understanding the mechanisms and effects of melt mixing on the relation between mantle and basalt heterogeneity is still in its infancy (e.g., [Rudge](#page-4-0) et al., 2013), it has become clear that the isotopic range of oceanic basalts is offset from and much smaller than that of the peridotitic mantle, as long as some degree of mixing between melts from heterogeneous peridotites and ICE enriched mantle components occurs [\(Eq. 1](#page-1-0), Fig. 2). Melt mixing is unavoidable, because melts from several 10–100 km wide and deep melting regions are funnelled to the localised eruption sites at the ridge axis or volcano at the surface (e.g., [Stracke, 2021](#page-5-0)).

# Implications for Mantle-Crust Mass Fluxes

Another critical effect of melt mixing is that oceanic basalts do not reflect the average extent of ICE depletion of the underlying peridotitic mantle. A column of peridotitic mantle that melted between 0 and 16 % and is 1.5 Ga old [\(Fig. 1](#page-1-0)), for example,<br>has average  $^{143}Nd^{144}Nd = 0.514327$  ( $\varepsilon_{Nd} = +33.1$ ), and  $176Hf^{177}Hf = 0.285310$  (ε<sub>Hf</sub> = +89.3). If a mantle source consisting of such heterogeneous peridotite also contains 3 % of recycled crust with  $^{143}Nd/^{144}Nd = 0.512762$  ( $\varepsilon_{Nd} = +2.6$ ), and  $^{176}$ Hf/<sup>177</sup>Hf = 0.282756 ( $\varepsilon$ <sub>Hf</sub> = −1.0), and the peridotites melt, on average, to 8 % and recycled crust to 64 %, the total

aggregated melt has  $^{143}Nd/^{144}Nd = 0.512866$  ( $\varepsilon_{Nd} = +4.6$ ), and  $^{176}Hf/^{177}Hf = 0.283029$  ( $\varepsilon_{Hf} = +8.6$ ) [\(Eq. 1\)](#page-1-0).

Using this average isotope ratio of the total extracted melts from such a heterogeneous mantle source, i.e. the isotope ratios of oceanic basalts, to evaluate the extent of mantle depletion will, therefore, by far underestimate the extent of ICE depletion of the peridotitic mantle, and thus the average rate of processing mantle through melting regions in the shallow mantle, which scales with the mantle's convective vigor. This also means that mantlecrust mass fluxes may be higher than inferred from MORB-based estimates of mantle depletion (e.g., [Jacobsen and Wasserburg,](#page-4-0) [1979;](#page-4-0) Galer et al.[, 1989](#page-4-0); [Kumari](#page-4-0) et al., 2016; [Tucker](#page-5-0) et al., 2020).

# Implications for Isotopic Differences Between MORB and OIB

Another implication of [Equation 1](#page-1-0) and Figures 2 and [3](#page-3-0) is that isotopic differences between oceanic basalts can be explained in several ways. For example,  $\varepsilon_{\text{Nd}}$  basalt can decrease from  $+8$ to  $+5$  because there is a larger contribution of melts from recycled crust with  $\varepsilon_{Nd}$  <sub>rc</sub> = -1, or because the peridotite melts derive from, on average, more ICE depleted peridotite ([Fig. 3\)](#page-3-0). The latter may, at first, be counterintuitive, because highly ICE depleted and aged peridotites have extremely high ε<sub>Nd per</sub> ([Figs. 1](#page-1-0), 2). However, because they are highly ICE depleted, high  $\varepsilon_{Nd\perp}$  are compensated by  $C_{per}^{\text{Nd}} \rightarrow 0$ , *i.e.* the contribution of Nd from peridotite melts,  $f_{\text{per}}C_{\text{per}}^{\text{Nd}}$   $\varepsilon_{\text{Nd per}} \rightarrow 0$ , and thus  $\varepsilon_{\text{Nd basalt}} \rightarrow \varepsilon_{\text{Nd rot}}$  irrespective of high  $\varepsilon_{\text{Nd per}}$  [\(Fig. 3\)](#page-3-0). Hence, the, on average, lower Hf-Nd and higher Ce isotope ratios of OIB compared to MORB ([White, 2015](#page-5-0); Willig et al.[, 2020;](#page-5-0) [Stracke](#page-5-0) et al., 2022) could either mean that 1) the mantle sources of OIB contain more recycled crust (for similar average peridotite compositions) than most MORB sources, or that 2) OIB sources contain similar amounts of recycled crust as MORB sources, but, on average, more extensively depleted peridotites ([Fig. 3\)](#page-3-0).

There are more aspects to consider. For example, it is clear that OIB range to different Sr-Nd-Hf-Pb isotope ratios than MORB [\(Zindler and Hart, 1986](#page-5-0); [White, 2015](#page-5-0); [Stracke, 2021;](#page-5-0) [Stracke](#page-5-0) et al., 2022 and references therein), and their mantle sources may, thus, not only contain different proportions, but



<span id="page-3-0"></span>

Figure 3 Isotope ratio of aggregated melt (basalt) formed by mixing melts from variably ICE depleted peridotite and recycled crust (parameters as in [Fig. 2\)](#page-2-0), showing that there are two principal reasons why OIB, on average, have lower Hf and Nd isotope ratios than MORB: 1) they contain more recycled crust (for similar average peridotite compositions), or 2) they contain similar amounts, but, on average, more extensively depleted peridotite (for similar recycled crust compositions).

also different types of recycled components. Broad linear trends in various combinations of Ce-Nd-Hf isotope ratio diagrams (e.g., Willig et al.[, 2020\)](#page-5-0) make it difficult to distinguish between different types of recycled crust, but Sr and Pb isotope ratios, in combination with Ce-Nd-Hf isotope ratios, may distinguish between different types of oceanic  $\pm$  continental crust (e.g., [Stracke, 2012](#page-5-0) and references therein). On the other hand, extremely high Nd-Hf and low Ce isotope ratios in ICE depleted and aged peridotites are a sensitive tracer of variably ICE depleted peridotite (Willig et al.[, 2020\)](#page-5-0). This is because mixing melts from heterogeneous peridotites and ICE enriched components forms linear trends subparallel to the global trends in Ce-Nd-Hf isotope diagrams, which are variably displaced toward high Hf-Nd and low Ce isotope ratios ([Salters](#page-5-0) et al., [2011](#page-5-0); [Béguelin](#page-4-0) et al., 2019; Willig et al.[, 2020](#page-5-0); [Sanfilippo](#page-5-0) et al., [2021](#page-5-0); [Stracke, 2021](#page-5-0)).

### Implications for Plume Buoyancy

Many OIB form above mantle upwellings, so called mantle "plumes", whose buoyancy is driven by thermochemical density deficits relative to the ambient mantle. Higher amounts of recycled crust make plumes denser, meaning that high temperatures are required to make them less dense than the ambient mantle (i.e. positively buoyant). Peridotites, however, also become less dense with increasing extent of melt depletion. Hence, lower temperature excesses are required to make melt-depleted peridotite positively buoyant.

For example, the compositional density of peridotite,  $\Delta \rho_{\rm cr}$  scales with the extent of melt depletion,  $F_{\rm D}$  ( $\Delta \rho_{\rm cr} \approx$ 214.5 kg m<sup>-3</sup> ×  $F_D$ ; [Afonso and Schutt, 2012\)](#page-4-0). That is, for *ca*. 8 % of melt extraction, peridotite density decreases by ∼0.5 % (reference mantle density,  $\rho_0 = 3300 \text{ kg m}^{-3}$ ). Density deficits of similar magnitude due to temperature alone require temper-ature excesses >150 °C [\(Fig. 4,](#page-4-0) T at  $F_D = 0$ ), assuming that the thermal density deficit,  $\Delta \rho_T$ , is due to thermal expansion of peridotite by  $\Delta \rho_T = -\rho_0 \times \alpha \times \Delta T$ , with  $\alpha$  being the thermal expansivity of  $3 \times 10^{-5}$  (K<sup>-1</sup>), and  $\Delta T$  being the excess temperature relative to ambient mantle potential temperature  $T_p$  ( $\Delta T$  =  $T_p - T_0$ ; with  $T_0 = 1350$  °C, [Ballmer](#page-4-0) *et al.*, 2013). For an excess density of the recycled oceanic crust of 180 kg m<sup>-3</sup> (Ishii [et al.](#page-4-0), [2019\)](#page-4-0), adding ∼9 % of recycled oceanic crust to a peridotitic mantle source  $(\rho_0 = 3300 \text{ kg m}^{-3})$  increases the density by ∼0.5 %. A temperature excess of ∼150 °C, or assuming a more melt-depleted peridotite from which ∼8 % of melt has been extracted, would make this heterogeneous peridotite-recycled crust assemblage neutrally buoyant [\(Fig. 4\)](#page-4-0).

Whether different proportions of recycled crust or more extensively depleted mantle is responsible for observed isotopic differences between MORB and OIB is, therefore, also a central question for understanding the thermochemical driving forces of active mantle upwellings (e.g., [Shorttle](#page-5-0) et al., 2014; [Stracke](#page-5-0) et al., [2019,](#page-5-0) [2022\)](#page-5-0), and mantle convective motion in general, and key for relating geochemical observations and geodynamic constraints.

# Summary and Perspectives

Highly heterogeneous peridotites with isotope ratios far beyond the MORB spectrum are a natural consequence of oceanic crust generation and mantle residence, and characterise the majority (>85–90 %) of Earth's mantle [\(Fig. 1](#page-1-0)). Heterogeneous peridotitederived melts, therefore, always influence oceanic basalt isotope ratios, even if subtly so ([Eq. 1](#page-1-0), [Figs. 2](#page-2-0), 3). [Equation 1](#page-1-0) is a basis for evaluating how basalt compositions reflect individual components of heterogeneous mantle sources, and for better constraining basalt-forming processes ([Figs. 2,](#page-2-0) 3). A key question to address further is whether peridotites in plume sources of OIB are more melt-depleted, and thus lighter than the peridotites of MORB sources. If composition is, indeed, a large factor



<span id="page-4-0"></span>

Figure 4 (a) Peridotite depletion  $F_D$  (%) versus temperature T (°C) of a model mantle source with 9 % of recycled oceanic crust ( $f_{rc} = 0.09$ ). (b) Excess temperature,  $ΔT$  (°C), required to make a mixture of variably depleted peridotite ( $F_D$ ) and recycled crust neutrally buoyant. δρ is the difference to the reference density  $\rho_0 = 3300$  kg m<sup>-3</sup>. Shown here is  $\delta \rho$  for all combinations of  $F_D$  and  $T_D$ , as discussed in the text.

for thermochemical plume buoyancy, plumes may not necessarily have to originate from thermal boundary layers and peridotite composition may also influence evolving plume structures. Variable peridotite depletion, therefore, connects geochemical and geophysical observables, and is a critical parameter for advancing our understanding of basalt generation, plume formation, and chemical geodynamic models of mantle convection.

# Acknowledgements

The authors thank Julie Prytulak and an anonymous reviewer for their constructive and thoughtful comments, and editor Horst Marshall for his conscientious and effective editorial handling.

Editor: Horst Marschall

# Additional Information



© 2024 The Authors. This work is distributed under the Creative<br>Commons Attribution Non-Attribution Non-Commercial No-Derivatives 4.0

License, which permits unrestricted distribution provided the original author and source are credited. The material may not be adapted (remixed, transformed or built upon) or used for commercial purposes without written permission from the author. Additional information is available at [https://www.](https://www.geochemicalperspectivesletters.org/copyright-and-permissions) [geochemicalperspectivesletters.org/copyright-and-permissions.](https://www.geochemicalperspectivesletters.org/copyright-and-permissions)

Cite this letter as: Stracke, A., Béguelin, P. (2024) Basalts record a limited extent of mantle depletion: cause and chemical geodynamic implications. Geochem. Persp. Let. 32, 21–26. [https://](https://doi.org/10.7185/geochemlet.2437) [doi.org/10.7185/geochemlet.2437](https://doi.org/10.7185/geochemlet.2437)

# References

- AFONSO, J.C., SCHUTT, D.L. (2012) The effects of polybaric partial melting on density and seismic velocities of mantle restites. Lithos 134, 289–303. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lithos.2012.01.009) [org/10.1016/j.lithos.2012.01.009](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lithos.2012.01.009)
- BALLMER, M.D., ITO, G., WOLFE, C.J., SOLOMON, S.C. (2013) Double layering of a thermochemical plume in the upper mantle beneath Hawaii. Earth and

Planetary Science Letters 376, 155–164. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2013.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2013.06.022) [06.022](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2013.06.022)

- BÉGUELIN, P., BIZIMIS, M., MCINTOSH, E.C., COUSENS, B., CLAGUE, D.A. (2019) Sources vs processes: Unraveling the compositional heterogeneity of rejuvenatedtype Hawaiian magmas. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 514, 119–129. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2019.03.011>
- GALER, S.J.G., GOLDSTEIN, S.L., O'NIONS, R.K. (1989) Limits on chemical and convective isolation in the Earth's interior. Chemical Geology 75, 257–290. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0009-2541\(89\)90001-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/0009-2541(89)90001-6)
- GENSKE, F., STRACKE, A., BERNDT, J., KLEMME, S. (2019) Process-related isotope variability in oceanic basalts revealed by high-precision Sr isotope ratios in olivine-hosted melt inclusions. Chemical Geology 524, 1–10. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2019.04.031) [10.1016/j.chemgeo.2019.04.031](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2019.04.031)
- HART, S.R. (1993) Equilibration during mantle melting: a fractal tree model. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 90, 11914–11918. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.90.24.11914) [doi.org/10.1073/pnas.90.24.11914](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.90.24.11914)
- HOFMANN, A.W., HART, S.R. (1978) An assessment of local and regional isotopic equilibrium in the mantle. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 38, 44–62. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0012-821X\(78\)90125-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/0012-821X(78)90125-5)
- ISHII, T., KOJITANI, H., AKAOGI, M. (2019) Phase relations of harzburgite and MORB up to the uppermost lower mantle conditions: precise comparison with pyrolite by multisample cell high‐pressure experiments with implication to dynamics of subducted slabs. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth 124, 3491–3507. <https://doi.org/10.1029/2018JB016749>
- JACOBSEN, S.B., WASSERBURG, G.J. (1979) Mean age of mantle and crustal reservoirs. Journal of Geophysical Research 84, 7411–7427. [https://doi.org/10.1029/](https://doi.org/10.1029/JB084iB13p07411) [JB084iB13p07411](https://doi.org/10.1029/JB084iB13p07411)
- KOORNNEEF, J.M., STRACKE, A., BOURDON, B., MEIER, M.A., JOCHUM, K.P., STOLL, B., GRÖNVOLD, K. (2012) Melting of a two-component source beneath Iceland. Journal of Petrology 53, 127–157. [https://doi.org/10.1093/](https://doi.org/10.1093/petrology/egr059) [petrology/egr059](https://doi.org/10.1093/petrology/egr059)
- KUMARI, S., PAUL, D., STRACKE, A. (2016) Open system models of isotopic evolution in Earth's silicate reservoirs: Implications for crustal growth and mantle heterogeneity. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 195, 142–157. [http://dx.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2016.09.011) [doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2016.09.011](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2016.09.011)
- LANGMUIR, C.H., KLEIN, E.M., PLANK, T. (1992) Petrological systematics of mid-ocean ridge basalts: constraints on melt generation beneath ocean ridges. Geophysical Monograph Series 71, 183–280. [https://doi.org/10.1029/](https://doi.org/10.1029/GM071p0183) [GM071p0183](https://doi.org/10.1029/GM071p0183)
- NEAVE, D.A., NAMUR, O., SHORTTLE, O., HOLTZ, F. (2019) Magmatic evolution biases basaltic records of mantle chemistry towards melts from recycled sources. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 520, 199–211. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2019.06.003) [epsl.2019.06.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2019.06.003)
- RUDGE, J.F., MACLENNAN, J., STRACKE, A. (2013) The geochemical consequences of mixing melts from a heterogeneous mantle. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 114, 112–143. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2013.03.042>
- SALTERS, V.J.M., STRACKE, A. (2004) Composition of the depleted mantle. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems 5, Q05B07, [http://doi.org/10.1029/](http://doi.org/10.1029/2003GC000597) [2003GC000597](http://doi.org/10.1029/2003GC000597)



- <span id="page-5-0"></span>SALTERS, V.J.M., MALLICK, S., HART, S.R., LANGMUIR, C.E., STRACKE, A. (2011) Domains of depleted mantle: New evidence from hafnium and neodymium isotopes. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems 12, Q10017, [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1029/2011GC003617) [10.1029/2011GC003617](https://doi.org/10.1029/2011GC003617)
- SANFILIPPO, A., SALTERS, V.J.M., SOKOLOV, S.Y., PEYVE, A.A., STRACKE, A. (2021) Ancient refractory asthenosphere revealed by mantle re-melting at the Arctic Mid Atlantic Ridge. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 566, 116981. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2021.116981>
- SANI, C., SANFILIPPO, A., PEYVE, A.A., GENSKE, F., STRACKE, A. (2023) Earth Mantle's Isotopic Record of Progressive Chemical Depletion. AGU Advances 4, e2022AV000792. <https://doi.org/10.1029/2022AV000792>
- SHORTTLE, O., MACLENNAN, J., LAMBART, S. (2014) Quantifying lithological variability in the mantle. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 395, 24–40. [http://dx.doi.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2014.03.040) [org/10.1016/j.epsl.2014.03.040](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2014.03.040)
- SHORTTLE, O., RUDGE, J.F., MACLENNAN, J., RUBIN, K.H. (2016) A Statistical Description of Concurrent Mixing and Crystallization during MORB Differentiation: Implications for Trace Element Enrichment. Journal of Petrology 57, 2127–2162. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/petrology/egw056>
- SODERMAN, C.R., SHORTTLE, O., MATTHEWS, S., WILLIAMS, H.M. (2022) Global trends in novel stable isotopes in basalts: theory and observations. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 318, 388–414. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2021.12.008>
- STRACKE, A. (2012) Earth's heterogeneous mantle: A product of convection-driven interaction between crust and mantle. Chemical Geology 330, 274–299. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2012.08.007>
- STRACKE, A. (2021) A process-oriented approach to mantle geochemistry. Chemical Geology 579, 120350. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2021.120350>
- STRACKE, A., BOURDON, B. (2009) The importance of melt extraction for tracing mantle heterogeneity. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 73, 218–238. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2008.10.015) [org/10.1016/j.gca.2008.10.015](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2008.10.015)
- STRACKE, A., SNOW, J.E., HELLEBRAND, E., VON DER HANDT, A., BOURDON, B., BIRBAUM, K., GÜNTHER, D. (2011) Abyssal peridotite Hf isotopes identify extreme mantle depletion. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 308, 359–368. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2011.06.012) [10.1016/j.epsl.2011.06.012](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2011.06.012)
- STRACKE, A., GENSKE, F., BERNDT, J., KOORNNEEF, J.M. (2019). Ubiquitous ultradepleted domains in Earth's mantle. Nature Geoscience 12, 851–855. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-019-0446-z>
- STRACKE, A., WILLIG, M., GENSKE, F., BÉGUELIN, P., TODD, E. (2022) Chemical geodynamics insights from a machine learning approach. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems 23, e2022GC010606. [https://doi.org/10.1029/](https://doi.org/10.1029/2022GC010606) [2022GC010606](https://doi.org/10.1029/2022GC010606)
- TUCKER, J.M., VAN KEKEN, P.E., JONES, R.E., BALLENTINE, C.J. (2020) A role for subducted oceanic crust in generating the depleted mid‐ocean ridge basalt mantle. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems 21, e2020GC009148. <https://doi.org/10.1029/2020GC009148>
- WHITE, W.M. (2015) Isotopes, DUPAL, LLSVPs, and Anekantavada. Chemical Geology 419, 10–28. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemgeo.2015.09.026>
- WILLIG, M., STRACKE, A., BEIER, C., SALTERS, V.J.M. (2020) Constraints on mantle evolution from Ce-Nd-Hf isotope systematics. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 272, 36–53. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2019.12.029>
- ZINDLER, A., HART, S. (1986) Chemical geodynamics. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences 14, 493–571. [https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ea.14.](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ea.14.050186.002425) [050186.002425](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ea.14.050186.002425)

